Peer Review Guidelines

Peer Review of the formal report:
Read the report you have been assigned. Start with the Dichotomous key to see the path to the unknown and make sure the author only writes about the 4 or 5 assays in that path for the Materials and Methods, Results and Discussion sections. Circle spelling mistakes and typos. Indicate areas that are factually incorrect, weakly written or generally not clear. Check the report to insure that it contains all the information, sections, figures and tables required in the assignment directions and insure the formatting of each conforms to the directions. A critical eye will both help your classmate to improve their paper through your comments and editing, and help you to improve yours as you will likely think of parts you can make better on your paper while you are criticizing someone else’s. Make comments and corrections right on the paper you are reading and use the checklist below to check off parts that are present and circle items that are missing. Return both the paper and this checklist to the author of the paper.

Formal Lab Report Grading Rubric
(Use this as a checklist for peer review: instructor will use this while grading the final papers)

Technical formatting criteria
- Typed, 12 point font
- Double spaced
- One-inch margins
- Name, date, course number in upper left
- Pages numbered
- Section headings bold, left justified
- Sections run continuous, not on separate pages
- No cover page/report cover

Writing Style
- Formal
- Third person
- Past tense (for Materials, Discussion & Conclusion)

Title
- Appropriate
- Centered, capitals on all non-article words
Introduction

Experiment description

Hypothesis: Present (if then statement of purpose)

Appropriate

Background: Experiment theory / Purpose of identification of bacteria in general
Characteristics of bacteria
Global significance of bacteria
Tools & Media important to identification

Citations for information

Good flow, tells a connected, cohesive story

Materials and Methods

Each assay in separate paragraph

For each assay:

Name media/procedure

Inoculation/procedure method

Incubation method (temperature & time)

Reagents/indicators added or steps performed

Citation of lab manual for media/method

Included only assays necessary to solve unknown

No discussion: only the materials (media/stain aspects) and methods (inoculation, incubation)

Results

Table:

Table number and Title

Assay/Characteristics

Media/Source

Observations

Results

No discussion included in results
Discussion

Separate paragraph for each assay/medium
Narrative form
Name media/procedure
Type of media/assay (selective, differential, complex, chemically defined)
Reagents/indicators
Enzymes, substrates, products
Color change reactions
All possible results described
Results for unknown
Citations

Conclusions

Evaluation of results
Logic flow to solve unknown
Solution of unknown
Dichotomous key
  Figure number and Title
  12 possible organisms
  Clear solution to each
  Only one characteristic/assay per branch (no “or”)
  Organism names italics, capital on genus, lined up on same horizon line

Makes reference to the key in the text
Explanation of each pathway in the key
  Logical flow
  Solution of each possible unknown

Literature cited

Proper CSE format
Lab book
Other sources

No inclusion of supplemental packet (either here or anywhere in the paper)